# CREDIT ACCESS BUSINESS UPDATE TO THE 

## HOUSE PENSIONS, INVESTMENTS \& FINANCIAL SERVICES COMMITTEE

February 18, 2013

## BY THE OFFICE OF CONSUMER CREDIT COMMISSIONER

## IMPLEMENTATION OF LEGISLATION FROM THE 82ND LEGISLATURE

HB 2592: Payday and Title Loan Disclosures
HB 2594: Payday and Title Loan Licensing

## Summary of Legistation

These bills amend Chapter 393 of the Finance Code establishing new requirements for "credit access businesses," which are credit services organizations (CSOs) that provide payday loans or title loans.

Under HB 2592, credit access businesses (CABs) are required to provide a consumer disclosure prescribed by the Finance Commission. The disclosure must include interest, fees, and APR for the loan and a comparison of those charges to "alternative forms of consumer debt," and it must describe fees that the consumer will incur for renewing the loan.

Under HB 2594, credit access businesses are required to obtain a license with the OCCC. The OCCC has examination and investigation authority over credit access businesses. HB 2594 also requires the Finance Commission to create an endowment for financial education in Texas.

The bills became effective January 1, 2012.

## Regulatory Activities

Licensing. A CAB license application must be processed within 30 days of receipt of a completed application package. Anticipating a high volume of CAB application submissions during the first months of calendar year 2012 (CY12), the Finance Commission (commission) promulgated rules regarding licensing and examination of credit access businesses and adopted a rule authorizing the issuance of a 90-day provisional license. The issuance of provisional licenses helped manage the licensing process through the transition and allowed recipients to continue operations until their applications had been fully processed.

| CAB Applications | as of $\mathbf{0 3 / 3 0 / 1 2}$ | as of $\mathbf{1 2 / 3 1 / 1 2}$ |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| Applications Filed | 3,451 | 3,804 |
| Applications Fully Approved | 2,579 | 3,504 |
| Applications Withdrawn | 161 | 201 |
| Provisional Licenses Pending | 3,002 | 3 |
| Applications Denied | -- | 26 |

Table 1: CAB applications received and processed as of April and December 2012.

Consumer Protection \& Examination. The commission adopted model disclosures for payday and title loan contracts in December 2011. The disclosures have been made available in both static and fillable formats to allow CABs to effectively comply with statutory and administrative requirements.

The examination process began mid-March 2012, and 253 examinations were conducted by the end of FY12, to include participation and coordination of examinations with the Federal Consumer Financial Protection Bureau (CFPB) and resulting in $90.91 \%$ of those examined being within acceptable compliance levels. The agency has conducted an additional 193 examinations between September and December 2012, resulting in $97.7 \%$ of those examined within this short time frame being within acceptable compliance levels.

Although the examination process has indicated that the majority of examined entities were within acceptable compliance levels, common violations and areas of non-compliance were identified. These violations include failure to provide or providing incorrect consumer disclosures; failure to post fee schedules; failure to obtain nonobligor signature; and charging of excessive or unauthorized late charges.

The consumer assistance section processed 390 complaints between January 1, 2012, and January 31, 2013 which represented $18.04 \%$ of all processed complaints by the agency during that 12 -month period. Consumer assistance pertaining to CAB transactions resulted in 12 consumers receiving refunds totaling \$5,193.86 since January 2012. Consumer complaints predominately pertain to contract issues and charges and fees related to both title and payday loans, as shown in the Table 2. An analysis of the two complaint categories for each product type has been presented in Table 3.

| January 1, 2012 through January 31, 2013 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Payday Loans |  | Title Loans |  |
| Complaint/Concern | \% of Closed Complaints | Complaint/Concern | \% of Closed Complaints |
| Excessive or Unauthorized Charges \& Fees | 33.3\% | Contract Issues | 26.5\% |
| Contract Issues ${ }^{1}$ | 26.7\% | Excessive or Unauthorized Charges \& Fees | 19.0\% |
| Collection Practices | 16.9\% | Repossessions | 19.0\% |
| Payment Posting/Procedures | 9.9\% | Title Issues | 10.9\% |

Table 2: Top four categories of consumer concerns regarding CAB products for the 12-month period Jan 1, 2012 through Jan 31, 2013.

[^0]
## Contract Issues: Payday

Of the 65 complaints received for contract issues,

- $30.8 \%$ represented alleged violations of terms of the contract; complaints associated with payment processing, payment processing and not honoring extension agreements; early payoffs; and 'being sued'.
- $26.2 \%$ represented consumer concerns and complaints related to not understanding the product type or how the product was explained to them.
- $10.8 \%$ represented consumer requests for agency assistance in obtaining amendments to contracts or payment arrangements.
- $10.8 \%$ represented complaints associated choice-of-law and Tribal entities associated with online products/transactions.
The remaining complaints represented concerns related to predatory lending (loans should not have been given to family members); 3-day right to cancel; allegations that the consumer did not sign the contract or was not provided with contracts or disclosures.


## Charges \& Fees: Payday

Of the 81 complaints received for charges and fees,

- $44.4 \%$ represented complaints of CAB fees being too high or increasing while principal was not decreasing and consumer not understanding the product or how it was explained to them.
- $24.7 \%$ represented consumers directly disputing or questioning the fees charged (e.g. NSF, late fee and similar charges).
- $14.8 \%$ represented complaints associated with choice-of-law and Tribal entities associated with the transactions.
The remaining complaints represented concerns regarding payment posting, processing and withdrawals from consumer accounts; issues arising from city ordinance; higher payment amounts resulting from refinancing in other cities; predatory lending; and third-party debt collectors.


## Contract Issues: Title

Of the 39 complaints received for contract issues,

- $30.8 \%$ represented alleged violations of terms of contract; contract law; powers of attorney; insurance; contesting third-party lenders; and requests for modifications.
- $28.2 \%$ represented consumer concerns and complaints related to not understanding the product or how the product was explained to them.
- $25.0 \%$ represented general complaints about the product itself.

The remaining complaints represented concerns related to allegations of fraud and statements that the consumer did not sign the contract or was not provided with contracts.

## Charges \& Fees: Title

Of the 28 complaints received for charges and fees,

- $78.6 \%$ represented complaints of CAB fees being too high or increasing while principal was not decreasing and consumer not understanding the product or how it was explained to them.
- $10.7 \%$ represented issues arising from city ordinance and higher payment amount resulting from refinancing in another city.

The remaining complaints or question regarding license requirements and repossession of vehicle based on nominal amount still owed (under \$20).

Table 3: Analysis of top two categories of complaints received for CAB products and transactions.

Legal Activities. The legal section has reported minimal enforcement actions taken or required since January 2012, and those taken predominantly pertain to compliance with quarterly reporting requirements.

| Type of Action | Number of Actions |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :--- |
| Administrative <br> Hearing | No. Hearings <br> Conducted/Scheduled: <br> No. Hearings Dismissed: | 2 | Cause of Action |
| License <br> Revocation | 1 | Applicant's appeal of license denial. |  |
| Applicants entered into agreed orders. |  |  |  |

Table 4: Administrative actions taken January 2012 through January 2013.

Non-Compliance with Quarterly Data Reporting

| 1st Quarter Reporting <br> Due April 30, 2012 | Incomplete Filings: 5 Store Locations <br> 1 provisional licensee, with 5 store locations, did not timely file 1st quarter reports. <br> Status: Licensee has filed completed reports. <br> All 1st-quarter reports have been filed. <br> 2nd Quarter Reporting <br> Due July 31, 2012Incomplete Filings: 5 Store Locations <br> 1 provisional licensee, with 5 store locations, has not filed 2nd-quarter <br> report filings. <br> Delinquent Filings: 6 Store Locations |
| :--- | :--- |
| 5 licensees, comprised of 6 store locations, have not filed 2nd-quarter reports. <br> Status: Licensees have filed completed reports. <br> All 2nd-quarter reports have been filed. |  |
| 3rd Quarter Reporting <br> Due October 31, 2012 | Delinquent Filings: 3 Store Locations <br> 3 licensees, comprised of 3 store locations, have not filed 3rd-quarter reports. |
| 4th Quarter Reporting <br> Annual Reporting <br> Due January 31, 2013 | The reporting period for 4th quarter and annual reports recently closed. Submitted <br> data and review for delinquency or non-compliance is ongoing. |

Table 5: Status of non-compliance with quarterly data reporting (1st through 3rd quarter, CY 2012).

Data Reporting. HB 2594 requires data reporting by the CABs that provides an industry snapshot as to the frequency of consumer use, fees assessed, and repayment characteristics. An online reporting site was launched in late March 2012 allowing the CABs to submit their quarterly data. Data reports have been received for all four quarters of calendar year 2012. Fourth quarter reporting concluded on January 31, 2013 with approximately 95\% of licensed entities reporting timely. Highlights of the quarterly data received are presented below; however, it is

Credit Access Business Update to the House Pensions, Investments, \& Financial Services Committee February 18, 2013 Page 5 of 8
noted that data submitted is still under review for reasonableness and licensees may be still be contacted to verify and correct submitted data as appropriate.

Deferred Presentment Transactions (Payday)

| Data Highlights | $\begin{gathered} \text { Quarter } \\ 1 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Quarter } \\ 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Quarter } \\ 3 \end{gathered}$ | Quarter 4 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Number of consumers obtaining credit | 556,175 | 603,815 | 647,945 | 552,782 |
| Number of payday loans obtained | 713,859 | 740,754 | 921,844 | 704,508 |
| Percentage of single installment payday loans | 90\% | 86\% | 85\% | 82\% |
| Single Installment Payday Loans |  |  |  |  |
| Average loan amount | \$471 | \$469 | \$479 | \$470 |
| Average fee per \$100 borrowed | \$22.67 | \$22.83 | \$23.25 | \$23.37 |
| Average original term (in days) | 19 | 19 | 19 | 19 |
| Effective annual rate | 445.51\% | 448.56\% | 456.64\% | 464.73\% |
| Percentage of customers refinancing new loans in same quarter | 75\% | 70\% | 67\% | 62\% |
| Of those customers refinancing, the average number of refinances per customer in the same quarter | 2.5 | 2.4 | 2.5 | 2.3 |
| Multiple Installment Payday Loans |  |  |  |  |
| Average loan amount | \$607 | \$560 | \$564 | \$564 |
| Average cab fee per $\$ 100$ borrowed $^{2}$ | \$130.55 | \$202.55 | \$175.25 | \$105.05 |
| Average original term (in days) | 98 | 98 | 91 | 107 |
| Effective annual rate**3 | 699.36\% | 1017.59\% | 899.62\% | 512.88\% |
| Percentage of Customers Refinancing new loans in same quarter | 46\% | 38\% | 29\% | 22\% |
| Of those customers refinancing, the average number of refinances per customer in the same quarter | 1.5 | 1.5 | 1.6 | 1.4 |
| Total number of locations reporting | 3,239 | 3,286 | 3,402 | 3,420 |

Table 6: Data highlights of deferred presentment transactions submitted through CAB quarterly and annual report filings for calendar year 2012.

[^1]Motor Vehicle Title Loans

| Data Highlights | Quarter 1 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Quarter } \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | Quarter $3$ | Quarter <br> 4 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Number of consumers obtaining credit | 91,407 | 109,068 | 117,027 | 110,014 |
| Number of title loans obtained | 112,658 | 130,663 | 138,408 | 123,049 |
| Percentage of single installment title loans | 88\% | 82\% | 84\% | 90\% |
| Single Installment Title Loans |  |  |  |  |
| Average loan amount | \$1,000 | \$980 | \$990 | \$1,091 |
| Average fee per \$100 borrowed | \$23.12 | \$24.22 | \$21.35 | \$21.87 |
| Average original term (in days) | 30 | 29 | 29 | 29 |
| Effective annual rate | 291.29\% | 314.85\% | 279.51\% | 285.26\% |
| Percentage of customers refinancing new loans in same quarter | 60\% | 53\% | 50\% | 39\% |
| Of those customers refinancing, the average number of refinances per customer in the same quarter | 1.8 | 1.7 | 1.7 | 1.5 |
| Multiple Installment Title Loans |  |  |  |  |
| Average loan amount | \$1,125 | \$1,149 | \$1,252 | \$1,227 |
| Average cab fee per \$100 borrowed | \$101.95 | \$131.18 | \$131.72 | \$81.52 |
| Average original term (in days) | 127 | 149 | 166 | 153 |
| Effective annual rate ${ }^{4}$ | 434.02\% | 444.92\% | 378.76\% | 293.95\% |
| Percentage of customers refinancing new loans in same quarter | 49\% | 21\% | 22\% | 20\% |
| Of those customers refinancing, the average number of refinances per customer in the same quarter | 1.3 | 1.6 | 1.3 | 1.5 |
| Vehicles repossessed during each quarter | 8,854 | 8,230 | 8,052 | 9,933 |
| Total number of locations reporting | 3,239 | 3,286 | 3,402 | 3,420 |

Table 7: Data highlights of motor vehicle title transactions submitted through CAB quarterly and annual report filings for calendar year 2012.

The annual report collects data on the number of accounts that were paid-in-full without refinancing and paid-infull within previously established parameter. Annual reporting concluded on January 31, 2013 with 3,377 entities reporting timely. Highlights of the annual data received are presented below; however, it is noted that data submitted is still under review for reasonableness and licensees may be still be contacted to verify and correct submitted data as appropriate.

Table 8 presents information related to CAB loans that were paid-in-full during calendar year 2012, as based on the data presented in submitted annual reports. The percentages provided do not consider and exclude any accounts that were still active (open) as of December 31, 2012, and any accounts that were never repaid after defaulting.

[^2]Table 9 extrapolates information from both the annual and quarterly reports. An additional row has been included to indicate the loans that have yet to be repaid (still active or open as of December 31, 2012).

CAB Accounts Paid-In-Full During Calendar Year 2012

| Description | Single Installment <br> Payday | Multi-Installment <br> Payday | Single Installment <br> Title | Multi-Installment <br> Title |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Repaid without refinancing | $52.12 \%$ | $76.31 \%$ | $47.75 \%$ | $70.15 \%$ |
| Repaid after 1 refinance <br> Repaid after refinancing <br> 2-4 times <br> Repaid after refinancing <br> 5-6 times <br> Repaid after refinancing <br> 7-10 times <br> Repaid after refinancing <br> more than 10 times | $13.30 \%$ | $12.77 \%$ | $17.43 \%$ | $22.54 \%$ |

Table 8: CAB accounts that were repaid by the borrower during calendar year 2012. The data above excludes 1) any accounts that were still active (open) as of December 31, 2012, or 2 ) any accounts that were never repaid after defaulting.

## CAB Account Activity Status During as of December 31, 2012

| Description | Single Installment <br> Payday | Multi-Installment <br> Payday | Single Installment <br> Title | Multi-Installment <br> Title |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Repaid without refinancing | $37.62 \%$ | $42.20 \%$ | $29.31 \%$ | $41.36 \%$ |
| Repaid after 1 refinance | $9.60 \%$ | $7.06 \%$ | $10.70 \%$ | $13.29 \%$ |
| Repaid after refinancing <br> 2-4 times | $16.29 \%$ | $4.51 \%$ | $13.42 \%$ | $2.50 \%$ |
| Repaid after refinancing <br> 5-6 times | $3.29 \%$ | $0.71 \%$ | $2.89 \%$ | $0.59 \%$ |
| Repaid after refinancing <br> 7-10 times | $3.21 \%$ | $0.50 \%$ | $1.60 \%$ | $0.60 \%$ |
| Repaid after refinancing <br> more than 10 times | $2.17 \%$ | $0.32 \%$ | $3.46 \%$ | $0.61 \%$ |

Table 9: Data presented extrapolates additional information based on data from both quarterly and annual reports. Calculation for "Account Yet to be Repaid" was performed by subtracting the total loans repaid (annual report) from the total loans made (annual report) and adding the beginning active accounts carried over from previous years (1st Quarter Report). The data presented in this table is an estimation due to the existence of companies closing before filing both reports used in this extrapolation.

Communication and Outreach. The agency has conversed with industry stakeholders and associations on myriad topics regarding licensing and examination processes, and met with individual groups as requested. The agency solicited industry stakeholder feedback regarding internet transaction regulation, provisional licensing, and licensing regulation during the third and fourth quarter of FY12.Webinars were conducted during the first and second quarters of FY13. The first webinar was conducted in September 2012 and provided assistance with data identification, definition and reporting as it relates to the quarterly report submissions. A second webinar was conducted in October 2012 and addressed general compliance topics targeted to specific industry stakeholders associated with a particular trade association. A third webinar was conducted in December 2012 and provided assistance with data identification and reporting as it related to the annual data report.

Texas Financial Education Endowment. As part of the licensing process each CAB location pays an annual assessment fee to OCCC to provide opportunities for asset building, improved consumer credit, and financial education ( $\$ 393.628$, Texas Finance Code). The assessments are collected by the OCCC during the licensing process and are deposited into an interest-bearing account with Texas Treasure Safekeeping Trust Company.

The endowment is administered by the Finance Commission of Texas and the purpose of the endowment is to fund programs that effectively support the financial empowerment of Texas consumers through financial education and awareness, primarily delivered and leveraged through grant awards to provider organizations. To date the endowment fund balance is approximately $\$ 1.5$ million.

The OCCC continues to work with the Finance Commission to develop grant application, administration and distribution policies. Over the next 6-12 months, the development and implementation of these policies will occur followed by grant distribution in accordance with approved program structure.

## Finance Commission of Texas - Resolution Supporting Uniformity of Laws Governing Credit Access Businesses.

 The commission adopted a resolution on April 20, 2012, in response to ordinances passed in certain Texas cities seeking to impose additional requirements or restrictions on CABs located within their city. Recently enacted local ordinances increase the complexity of compliance for Texas CABs. The resolution is a request to the Texas Legislature to amend the laws concerning CABs and to clearly articulate the legislature's intent for uniform laws and rules to govern CABs.
## PAYDAY LOAN—SINGLE PAYMENT

After reviewing the terms of the loan, you are not required to choose this loan, and may consider other borrowing options, including those shown on Page 2 of this document.

| Borrowed |
| :--- |
| Amount |

Interest
Contract Rate: \%
Fees
Payback
Amount

The loan information shown here is an example and may not reflect the actual fees and interest charged to a loan provided by the lender or credit access business.

How much will a

loan cost?

| If I pay the <br> loan in: |
| :--- |
| 2 Weeks |
| 1 Month |
| to pay: |

## How Long Could It Take to Repay a Loan?

Of 10 people who take out a new payday loan...

$21 / 2$ people will pay the loan on time and in 1 payment (typically two weeks)

2 people will renew the loan 1 or 2 times

1 1/2 people will renew the loan 3 or 4 times

4 people will renew the loan 5 or more times

Adapted from: Bertrand \& Morse, "Information Disclosure, Cognitive Biases and Payday Borrowing", Milton Friedman Institute for Research in Economics (Oct. 2009).
Data provided above is compiled from a 2008 national survey; repayment patterns may be different.


## Ask Yourself...

- Is it necessary for me to borrow the money?
- Can I afford to pay this loan back in full in two weeks?
- Will I be able to pay my regular bills and repay this loan?
- Can I afford the extra charges, interest, and fees that may be applied if I miss or fail to make payment?
- Are other credit options available to me at this time?


## How Does a Payday Loan Compare to Other Options?



Payday loans are cash advances provided to a borrower to meet financial needs. As a borrower, you will be required to sign a loan agreement that tells you the amount you have requested to borrow, the annual percentage rate (APR) for that loan, the amount of interest and fees that may be charged for that loan, and the payment terms of the loan. Payday loans may be one of the more expensive borrowing options available to you. Payday loans may also be referred to as cash advance, delayed deposit or deferred presentment loans.

## Complaint or Concern?

If you would like to file a concern or complaint
regarding a payday loan, contact the
Office of
Consumer Credit
Commissioner
800-538-1579

Looking for Information on Budgeting, Personal Savings, Credit Card Management, or other personal money management skills?

Visit the OCCC's Financial Literacy Resource Page
http://www.occc.state.tx.us/ pages/consumer/education/
Financial_Literacy_Resources.html

## Additional Information

- You may be required to write checks or authorize withdrawals from personal checking accounts to cover payments for the loans.
- You can compare all loan options available and select the option that is best for you.
- You can avoid extra fees and loan renewal costs by not missing payments and by repaying loans on time.


## AUTO TITLE LOAN—SINGLE PAYMENT

## Borrowed

Amount
Interest
Contract Rate: \%
Fees
Includes a one-time \$
certificate of title fee.

## Payback

Amount
The loan information shown here is an example and
may not reflect the actual fees and interest charged
to a loan provided by the lender or credit access
business.

## How Long Could It Take to Repay a Loan?

Of 10 people who take out a new auto title loan...

2.7 people will not renew their title loans
2.4 people will renew the loan 1 or 2 times
1.3 people will renew the loan 3 or 4 times

3.6 people will renew the loan 5 or more times

[^3]

## Ask Yourself...

- Is it necessary for me to borrow the money?
- Can I afford to pay this loan back in full in one month?
- Will I be able to pay my regular bills and repay this loan?
- Can I afford the extra charges, interest, and fees that may be applied if I miss or fail to make payment?


## - Are other credit options

 available to me at this time?

## How Does an Auto Title Loan Compare to Other Options?



Auto title loans are cash advances provided to a borrower to meet financial needs. As a borrower, you will be required to use your car as collateral for the loan. You will be required to sign a loan agreement that tells you the amount you have requested to borrow, the annual percentage rate (APR) for that loan, the amount of interest and fees that may be charged for that loan, and the payment terms of the loan. Auto title loans may be one of the more expensive borrowing options available to you. Auto title loans may also be referred to as car title loans, title loans, or title pledges.

## Complaint or Concern?

If you would like to file a concern or complaint regarding an auto title loan, contact the

Office of Consumer Credit Commissioner 800-538-1579

Looking for Information on Budgeting, Personal Savings, Credit Card Management, or other personal money management skills?

Visit the OCCC's Financial Literacy Resource Page
http://www.occc.state.tx.us/ pages/consumer/education/
Financial_Literacy_Resources.html

## Additional Information

- You may be required to write checks or authorize withdrawals from personal checking accounts to cover payments for the loans.
- You can compare all loan options available and select the option that is best for you.
- You can avoid extra fees and loan renewal costs by not missing payments and by repaying loans on time.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ This category encompasses allegations or consumer concerns regarding violations of terms and conditions, fees and charges, fraud or misrepresentation, cross-collateralization between products, collection practices, choice of law/tribal entity, and failure to receive copy of contract.

[^1]:    ${ }^{2}$ There is a low level of confidence in these figures due to suspected inaccurate, and unverifiable, reporting of average CAB fee per $\$ 100$ borrowed.
    ${ }^{3}$ Effective Annual Rate is calculated by rounding to the nearest number of 14 -day installments and assumes that the CAB fee is collected on a straight-line basis with each payment.

[^2]:    ${ }^{4}$ Effective Annual Rate is calculated by rounding to the nearest number of 30-day installments and assumes the CAB fee is collected on a straight-line basis with each payment.

[^3]:    Adapted from: Tennessee Department of Financial Institutions, "The 2010 Report on the Title Pledge Industry", (Mar. 2010). Data based upon title pledge agreements with a single-payment term; repayment patterns may vary.

